UNDERSTANDING DIVIDED BALTIMORE

How Data, Especially Mapped Data, Informed the Course
WHAT WE WERE TRYING TO DO

• Divided Baltimore was a UB response to the events of April 2015.
• We wanted to share information widely with students and with interested community members with hope that we could catalyze interest in learning how Baltimore became so divided.
• Presentations built around a community forum
• Graduate, undergraduate, and dual enrollment high school students were enrolled in sections of the course with their own instructor.
THE NEW YORK TIMES CAPTURED HOW WE ORGANIZED THE COMMUNITY FORUM


October 20, 2015 - By A.J. CHAVAR - U.S. - Print Headline: "Uniting a Divided Baltimore"
• Today, we want to report on how we relied on the good work of BNIA and many of you in compiling data and maps that help immeasurably in comprehending the issues we face in Baltimore in achieving a fair society.
• UB History Professor Betsy Nix developed a lecture on the history of segregation in Baltimore that she has now presented to a range of agencies and groups from Annie E. Casey to OSI to the last round of Baltimore City Police recruits.
1860

212,418 residents

25,500 or 12%
free people of color

from Freedom’s Port
The Baltimore Chop

1937 Redlining Map

The Baltimore Chop
Baltimore Neighborhood Indicators Alliance, University of Baltimore
Baltimore Neighborhood Indicators Alliance, University of Baltimore
SEEMA IYER INTRODUCED US TO BNIA DATA AND HOUSING ISSUES

- Baltimore Neighborhood Indicators Alliance
- Use of data to track neighborhood quality of life
- Ecometrics – economic, environmental and social
- Vacant and abandoned housing is an environmental justice issue
• Baltimore is a City of Neighborhoods
• *Durable* properties of places based on people, history, geography
• Ecometrics of places: indicators that track the context for social-economic-ecological processes
DATA MAPS AND INDICATORS

Percent of Properties that are Vacant and Abandoned, 2013

Percent of Families Receiving Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF), 2013

Percent of the Adult Population that is on Parole or Probation, 2013
The Right Investment?

MARYLAND TAXPAYER SPENDING ON CORRECTIONS IN BALTIMORE

Annual state spending on corrections in each Community Statistical Area

Less than $2 million
$2 million – $5 million
$5 million – $10 million
$10 million – $15 million
More than $15 million

THE COST TO INCARCERATE ONE PERSON FROM BALTIMORE COULD BUY 1 MONTH OF HOUSING FOR 30 FAMILIES

JusticPolicy.org/TheRightInvestment

Justice Policy Institute
What Can You Do?

- Consider both people and place—Look at the context in which we work around justice and equity
- Come together as a city to address vacant housing
  - All property owners
  - Elected officials, city agencies, foundations
- Look at policies that keep our most vulnerable populations “stuck” in high vacancy neighborhoods
- Access to work via reliable transportation is the most critical factor for social mobility and overcoming poverty
Understanding the employment domain

Baltimore Divided

Tylis Cooper
STRUCTURAL RACISM

System of advancing access and privileges to one group while through a system of unwritten and unspoken practices, deny the full-personhood of another.

- Education systems
- Health systems
- Criminal system
- Employment system
- Class design
- Disparities across domains
- Interdependence
Race is an idea and not a fact

Development of racism is typically undergirded by the ideology of inferiority in which some population groups are regarded as being inferior to others

“This often leads to the development of negative attitudes and beliefs towards racial outgroups (prejudice), and differential treatment of members of these groups by both individuals and social institutions (discrimination).

Bonilla-Silva, 1996: Williams 2004
DISCRIMINATION AS A SYSTEM

- **Disparity** – refers to any difference in an outcome.
- Sociologist are concerned with disparities when they systematically favor some groups over others.
- **Discrimination** – refers to unwarranted differential treatment of persons based on group membership.

Reskin 2004
EMPLOYMENT AND INCOME

**Income Disparities**

Median Household Income 2012

- United States: $108,844
- Howard County: $89,179
- Anne Arundel County: $80,028
- Carroll County: $76,645
- Harford County: $62,444
- Baltimore County: $39,241
- Baltimore City: $51,371

Source: American Community Survey 2012 Estimates

---

**Racial Disparities in Opportunity**

Average Unemployment Rate By Race 2006-2010, Baltimore Region

- White: 4.3%
- Black: 9.6%
- Latino: 5.6%
- Asian: 3.7%
- Other/Two or More Races: 7.8%
- Total, All Races: 5.8%

Source: American Community Survey 2006-2010 Estimates
## A NEIGHBORHOOD UNHEARD
The Sandtown-Winchester/Harlem Park neighborhoods of Baltimore, where Freddie Gray lived, are among the poorest in the city. Here is a quick snapshot of the area, compared to Baltimore as a whole.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>S-W/HP</th>
<th>BALTIMORE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of residents</td>
<td>14,801</td>
<td>616,802</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of African-Americans</td>
<td>96.9</td>
<td>63.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment rate</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median household income</td>
<td>22,277.0</td>
<td>37,395.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of families living in poverty</td>
<td>30.9</td>
<td>15.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of buildings vacant</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juvenile arrest rate</td>
<td>25.2</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homicide rate (Per 10,000)</td>
<td>45.3</td>
<td>20.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life expectancy</td>
<td>65.3</td>
<td>71.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Baltimore City Health Department's 2011 Neighborhood Health Profile
**Challenges in Sandtown-Winchester/Harlem Park**

The challenges that Baltimore communities face contribute to a cycle of incarceration, poverty, and lost opportunity. Redirecting people and funds away from prison would help Baltimore City address these persistent challenges and barriers to the success of each community. Specific indicators of the challenges faced by this community include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenge</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population 16-64 not Employed (2008-2012)*</td>
<td>51.8 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed Population with Travel Time to Work of 45 Minutes or More (2012)</td>
<td>31.8 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Median Household Income (2008-2012)</td>
<td>$24,006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Families Receiving TANF (2012)</td>
<td>25.0 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9th-12th Grade Students that are Chronically Absent (2012)</td>
<td>49.3 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population (25 years and over) with Less than a High School Diploma (2012)</td>
<td>60.7 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Narcotics Calls for Service per 1,000 Residents (2011)</td>
<td>464.8 calls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mortality Rate for 15-24 year olds (2012)</td>
<td>19.0 per 1,000 youth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Expectancy (2012)</td>
<td>68.8 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residential Properties that are Vacant or Abandoned (2012)</td>
<td>33.1 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children (aged 0-6) with Elevated Blood-Lead Levels (2012)</td>
<td>7.4 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violent Crime Rate</td>
<td>23.0 per 1,000 residents</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MAJOR BARRIERS TO EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY

- Education, Training and Skill barriers
- Transportation and Housing barriers
- Structural Racism
- Systems limitations
- Industry, and Career barriers
- Social barriers

Opportunity Collaboration, Barriers to Employment Opportunity in the Baltimore Region June 2014
SPECIFIC BARRIERS TO EMPLOYMENT

- Child support arrears
- Longer commutes
- Dependence on public transportation
- Criminal history
- Poor or inaccurate credit reports
- Suspended driver’s licenses
- Intimate partner violence
- Prior homelessness
- Mental illness
- Substance abuse
- Low levels of education
DISPARITIES AND INTERDEPENDENCE IN BALTIMORE

A Look at Disparity in Baltimore

- **Median household income**
  - Baltimore City: $41,385.00
  - North Baltimore/Guilford/Homewood: $24,822.40
  - Sandtown-Winchester/Harlem Park: $15,742.60

- **Unemployment rate**
  - Baltimore City: 14.2%
  - North Baltimore/Guilford/Homewood: 7.2%
  - Sandtown-Winchester/Harlem Park: 22.7%

- **Percent of female-headed households with children under 18**
  - Baltimore City: 54.9%
  - North Baltimore/Guilford/Homewood: 15.1%
  - Sandtown-Winchester/Harlem Park: 73.4%

- **Percentage of residential properties that are vacant and abandoned**
  - Baltimore City: 8%
  - North Baltimore/Guilford/Homewood: 0.4%
  - Sandtown-Winchester/Harlem Park: 34.3%

- **Median household income**
  - Sandtown: $22,000
  - Baltimore (black): $30,000
  - Baltimore (white): $45,000
  - Maryland: $40,000

Source: Baltimore Neighborhood Indicators Alliance, Jacob France Institute, University of Baltimore

SOURCE: Baltimore Neighborhood Indicators Alliance and 2013 American Community Survey
HOW DO WE MOVE THE NEEDLE?

- Create clear pathways to employment
- Prioritize affordable job transportation
- Increase adult basic education and GED programs
- Continue to empower UB students to use the data in the classroom
PROF. CASSANDRA JONES HAVARD LECTURED ON FRINGE BANKING

- Utilized data to show fringe banking and the unbanked
- Eye-opening experience after reading an article about a Victoria Keys, who closed her account after the bank raised the monthly minimum
- Many are underbanked by simple geography, and must rely on check-cashing and pay-day loan establishments
FRINGE BANKING IN BALTIMORE
The Dollar Volume of AFS Transactions Totals More Than $320 Billion Annually

- Buy-Here-Pay-Here Auto Loans, $80 billion
- Check Cashing, $58 billion
- Payday Loans, $48 billion
- Rent-to-Own Transactions, $7 billion
- Money Orders, $17 billion
- Remittances, $46 billion
- Refund Anticipation Loans, $26 billion
- Open Loop Prepaid Cards, $39 billion

Sources: FiSCA, World Bank, Mercator Advisory Group, U.S. Treasury, Association of Progressive Rental Organizations, and Leedom and Associates LLC.
• Visits check cashing places to cash checks; use of auto-title loans or payday loans for “credit.”
• Financially excluded include the unbanked 28.2% (no formal banking) and under-banked 14.3% (may have a checking account).
• Baltimore is the 10th largest unbanked city
BANKING FOR ALL

• Promote and encourage the use of banks
• Banks must serve the needs of the community
• Affordable banking products for everyone

WHO ARE THE UNBANKED?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGE</th>
<th>More than 3x as likely</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Worldwide</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less likely</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EDUCATION</th>
<th>2x as likely</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tertiary</td>
<td>Primary or less</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INCOME</th>
<th>More than 3x as likely</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Richer</td>
<td>Poorer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RESIDENCE</th>
<th>35%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>Rural</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Global Findex shows gaps in financial inclusion across demographics, with workers, the poor, youth, and rural residents at the greatest disadvantage.
MISSED OPPORTUNITIES: HOW TRANSPORTATION CONTRIBUTES TO A DIVIDED BALTIMORE

Eric Norton
Central Maryland Transportation Alliance
Transportation Emerges as Crucial to Escaping Poverty

Mikayla Bouchard May 7, 2015

James Baker was pedaling to work along a slick, snow-covered road in Frederick County, Md., when a traffic light changed abruptly. He braked and fell, breaking his ankle.
“The relationship between transportation and social mobility is stronger than that between mobility and several other factors, like crime, elementary-school test scores or the percentage of two-parent families in a community, said Nathaniel Hendren, a Harvard economist and one of the researchers on the study.”
WHERE WE WENT

• BNIA tracks length of commute by neighborhood
• The indicator used is Percent of Employed Population with Travel Time to Work of 45 Minutes and Over
• There is a strong correlation between neighborhoods with a prevalence of long commute times and signs of distress, including high unemployment, high poverty, and low life expectancy
## WHAT WE FOUND

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top 5 Neighborhoods</th>
<th>Bottom 5 Neighborhoods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Sandtown-Winchester/ Harlem Park – 34%</td>
<td>52. Inner Harbor/Federal Hill – 13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Greater Rosemont – 33%</td>
<td>53. Downtown/Seton Hill – 12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Greenmount East – 31%</td>
<td>54. Greater Roland Park/Poplar Hill – 12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Oldtown/Middle East – 31%</td>
<td>55. North Baltimore/Guilford/ Homeland – 12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Poppleton/The Terraces/ Hollins Market – 31%</td>
<td>56. Canton – 11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WHERE DO WE GO?

• The Maryland Transit Administration is working on a complete overhaul of the local bus network, a project called BaltimoreLink

• BaltimoreLink is the largest change in our transit network in decades

• MTA is developing metrics to measure the effectiveness of the new system

• Using BNIA’s data and maps, we are asking MTA to focus on these disconnected communities

• Will commute times by transit go down?

• Will access to jobs improve?
ACTION RESEARCH AND FOOD DESERTS: ENCOURAGING SYNERGY
DARIEN RIPPLE

Developing a Partnership Network
LOWER PARK HEIGHTS

- Median Household Income - $24,175.20
- Percent of Children Living Below the Poverty Line - 54.1
- Percent of Family Households Living Below the Poverty Line - 38.4
- Percent of Residents – Black/African-American - 95.7
- Percent of Vacant Properties Owned by Baltimore City - 24.3
- Percent of Housing Units Owner Occupied - 45.1
- Median Price of Homes Sold - $28,500.00
- High School Completion Rate - 76.5
- Kindergarten School Readiness - 63.5
- Percent of 9th-12th Grade Students Chronically Absent - 39.9
- Percent of Households with No Vehicles Available - 43.1
- Percent Population 16-64 Unemployed not in labor Force - 38.0
- Unemployment Rate - 26.5
- http://bniajfi.org/community/Southern%20Park%20Heights/
CORE PARTNERS

• **University of Baltimore (UB)** – urban, public anchor institution that combines theory & practice for innovation and life-long learning.

• **Creative City Charter School, Inc. (CC)** – new, progressive charter elementary school in lower Park Heights (Baltimore City) focused on arts-based and place-based learning.

• **Maryland Commission on Civil Rights (MCCR)** – independent state agency that enforces anti-discrimination laws, educates the public, and works to promote and improve civil/human rights statewide.
ACTION RESEARCH

• UB CSCE 200: Understanding Community – Dr. Darien Ripple
• UB PUAD 629: Public Program Evaluation – Dr. Samuel Brown
• UB HSER 420: Program Design and Proposal Writing – Dr. Mariglynn Edlins

• Greater Baltimore Orchard Project
• UB Urban Farming Club
• Blue Water Baltimore
• Possible MCCR and/or UB Student Facilitators
PARK HEIGHTS FOOD, FARM & COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIP--3 YEAR DRAFT PLAN

• To create a new, vital partnership among UB, Creative City Charter School and MCCR that utilizes resources, networks and strengths from each to effect change in Park Heights

• To contribute to the transformation of Park Heights from a food desert to a community with access to healthy & affordable food choices

• To build capacity within the Park Height community for sustainable dialogue and programs to address racial and social inequities

• To build on Creative City’s place-based approach and help students connect with nature by planting, harvesting and preparing their own fresh food from the school garden

• To use seed-to-table programming as an engaging project arc through which to teach literacy, math and other core concept

• To address food insecurity in our community by educating students, their families, and community members about growing and preparing their own food

• To expand food access, and education, to the surrounding community by engaging neighbors as our partners in Creative City’s garden

• To allow UB students to explore basic concepts of community: a group’s history and change over time, the lines that divide communities, the physical movement of groups, the responsibilities of individuals within the community and the role community plays in social control
CSCE 200 – UNDERSTANDING COMMUNITY

Team Experiential Learning Project - The Team will discuss and design a project focused on Park Heights and the Creative City Charter School.

Project Goals

- Lay groundwork = coalition building/identifying potential community leaders and project partners (building trust!)
- Connect to the local restaurants, grocers, delis, etc. to inform and build partnership around the project idea (building support and trust!)
- Complete school garden assessment and strategic plan
- Educational programming for students, families and community members (gardens, CSA, cooking, Brassica, etc.)
WHAT DID WE LEARN IN THE DIVIDED BALTIMORE COURSE?

- This student’s remarks early in the course made it all worthwhile:
- [https://panopto.ubalt.edu/Panopto/Pages/Viewer.aspx?id=340830f4-46fa-4b11-8145-f01e0ff0b967](https://panopto.ubalt.edu/Panopto/Pages/Viewer.aspx?id=340830f4-46fa-4b11-8145-f01e0ff0b967)
- [Sarah Welch’s reflection on the meaning of the course]
OTHER STUDENT REACTIONS

“I’m more aware of the history of Baltimore and structural racism”

“The class help me understand questions about race and inequality”

“The open and honest conversations made it easy to talk about things I’ve felt but could never discuss in class before”

“Course should be offered every semester and required for everyone”

“I’d love to have a service project incorporated into the class”

“I’m more aware of the history of Baltimore and structural racism”

“Being able to look at data for my community was an eye-opener”